

A DIFFERENT DIMENSION OF TURCOPHOBIA: "ARMENIAN GENOCIDE" MEMORIALS IN THE WORLD

(TÜRK DÜŞMANLIĞI'NIN BİR BAŞKA YÜZÜ:
DÜNYA ÜZERİNDEKİ "SOYKIRIM" ANITLARI)

Prof. Dr. Enis ŞAHİN*

Department of History
Sakarya University

Armenian Desk, Turkish Historical Society

Abstract: *This article suggests that cultural assets in the form of monuments and inscriptions keep alive historical memory. These assets and the places where they are situated take an important place in the memories and agendas of people and nations due to the fact that they address the crowd psychology. Thus we argue that one of the neglected aspects of Turkish-Armenian relations up to the present is the question of monuments and inscriptions. Those kinds of objects played an important role in the formation of some images such as "Cruel Turk" and "Oppressed Armenian". In this article we'll try to show the fact that increasing number of monuments commemorating an "Armenian Genocide" enhances a negative perception towards Turkey and the Turkish people by increasing hostilities.*

Keywords: *Armenian, monuments, inscriptions, historical memory*

Öz: *Bu makale anıtlar ve yazıtlar şeklindeki kültürel varlıkların tarihsel hafızayı canlı tuttuklarını öne sürmektedir. Bu varlıklar ve mekânlar, toplumsal psikolojiye hitap etmeleri hasebiyle buldukları yerlerde insanların ve halkların anıları ve gündemlerinde önemli bir yer kazanmaktadır. Nitekim bu makalede anıt ve yazıtlar sorununun Türk-Ermeni ilişkiler açısından günümüze kadar göz ardı edilen önemli bir konu olduğu öne sürülmektedir. Bu objeler "Acımasız Türk" ve "Mağdur Ermeni" gibi algıların oluşmasında önemli rol oynamışlardır. Artan sayıda "Ermeni Soykırımı" anıtının Türkiye ve Türk insanına karşı önyargıların oluşmasında olumsuz bir rol oynadığı iddia edilmektedir.*

Anahtar Kelimeler: *Ermeni, anıt, yazıt, tarihsel hafıza*

* I express my sincere thanks to Kadriye Topal and Selin Eren for their contributions in translating this article into English.

The year 1915 when the Union and Progress government took the decision to relocate Armenians was the date that Turkish-Armenian relations which tensed especially after Berlin Treaty turned into a severe crisis. Therefore that year was a milestone for the Armenians. They approach their history particularly in view of the events in that year and classify it as before and after 1915. In that year, two dates were important regarding the Armenians, April 24th and May 27th when *Sevk ve İskan Kanunu* was introduced. Among these dates especially the former one became prominent. As it is well-known on April 24th 1915, an operation was conducted against the Armenian committees throughout the country and especially in Istanbul by the Ottoman

For the Armenians who live throughout the world especially in the Republic of Armenia, April 24th, by the impact of campaigns carried out in especially 1965 which was fiftieth anniversary of 1915 events and onwards, became a date of commemoration of Armenian Genocide that was conducted by the Turks.

government and some arrestments were made as a result of those operations. Those arrestments prevented the Armenian committees to terrorize. However, the Armenians who could not reach their aims described 24th April executions as “genocide” against the Ottoman state and launched “slander campaigns” with the support of some great powers.

Those campaigns became struggle for “existence” for the Armenians and followed by them constantly. For the Armenians who live throughout the world especially in the Republic of Armenia, April 24th, by the impact of campaigns carried out in especially 1965 which was fiftieth anniversary of 1915 events and onwards, became a date of commemoration of Armenian Genocide that was conducted by the Turks. In other words, it was the date of the so-called “genocide” of the Armenians in their own belief system. Yet, the attempt of the Ottoman state aimed at restraining “its Armenian subjects” from their hazardous activities. However, even those attempts were considered as beginning of “the planned genocide” conducted by the Turkish state against themselves and the belief based on that assumption survived until today increasingly. In this respect, April 24th is considered as “a second religion” among the Armenians and it seems impossible to talk about and discuss it among themselves or in other spheres.

The “Turcophobia” fact that is tried to be survived on every April 24th is the origin of nationalism for Armenians. Therefore, the Armenians didn’t want to pass that date just with commemorations in vain and desired to monumentalize their hatred and hostility against the Turks with a view to intensifying the meaning and influence of “hostility and hate literature” and passing “a purposeful heritage” on next generation. Moreover, until the last

half-century, while the European nations, the history of which was full of “war and blood”, intended even to write “a mutual history textbook” and form “a common future”, what the aim of a handful of Armenians is by continuing this “imaginary hostility” is still in question. However, as a result of these negative thoughts full of hatred, the propaganda and political activities which they carried out in their country, they put signature to some decisions against Turkey and Turks and also get other countries sign those decisions. Besides these activities they erected numerous monuments that represent the events of 1915 as genocide and tried to add a monumental meaning to the symbolic date of April 24th. Eventually, they materialized their thoughts regarding “Turcophobia” and the thesis of “Armenian nation belonging to a community which was exposed to genocide”. This situation contributes to the sense of nationalism to develop among Armenians, supports the propaganda based on dramatizing themselves and is considered as a factor preventing their assimilation. However, the main and inconvenient side of this propaganda-for Turks- is undoubtedly its being based on the idea of “Turcophobia”. Furthermore, such an approach occurs between two societies that lived together for ages as if they did not have another kind of relationship. Dealing with the history of Armenians by separating it as before and after 1915 is a consequence of this approach. On the other hand, as below mentioned, the abundance in the number of memorials reveals the extent of the “Turcophobia” and propagandas among the Armenians.

“Armenian Genocide” Memorials in the World

It can be stated that the practice of erecting inscriptions and memorials in order to materialize and memorialize the “Turcophobia” among the Armenians has been encountered since other words since the 50th anniversary of 1915 events and continues by having been traditionalized. This practice is generally known as “war memorial” or “genocide memorial”. In the world, there are recorded 126 memorials, monumental structures, inscriptions and museums outside of Armenia. France is the only country having more structures than even Armenia. While France has 36 structures, the number is the Republic of Armenia. In this respect, the known total number is 154. While giving information about the memorials which are the reflections of Armenians’ Turcophobia, firstly those in the Republic of Armenia will be dealt and then the countries having Armenian memorials will be given in alphabetical order. It is possible to list the countries where inscriptions/memorials/monuments regarding Armenians and the number of these structures as below: Germany (3), The United States of America (28), Argentina (4), Australia (2), Austria (2), Belgium (1), Brazil (2), Bulgaria (2), Ethiopia (1), France (36), Georgia (1), India (1), Netherlands

(1), England (2), Iran (7), Israel (1), Switzerland (1), Italy (2), Canada (3), Southern Cyprus (2), Lebanon (5), Egypt (2), Poland (1), Syria (6), Chile (2), Ukraine (3), Uruguay (2), Venezuela (1), and Greece (2).

1. Genocide Memorials in the Republic of Armenia

As in the United States of America, there exist 28 “genocide memorials” within the homeland of Armenians, the Republic of Armenia. The greatest of them is Monument, Museum and Research Complex at Dsidsernakaberd in Yerevan and it is accepted as central. It is in the position of main base of Armenians’ Turcophobia and hatred. 28 memorials in Armenia can be listed as:

1. Monument, Museum and Research Complex at Dsidsernakaberd in Yerevan.
2. Self-Defense Battle Memorial of Artsiv Vaspurakan in Agarak Village.
3. Fountain-Memorial, Aintab.
4. Self-Defense Battle of Aintab Memorial.
5. War Memorial in Aparan.
6. Memorial in Balahovid Village.
7. Memorial in Chachour Village.
8. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Edjmiadsin.
9. Memorial in Geghartavank.
10. Memorial in Kapan.
11. Memorial in Martuni Village.
12. Self-Defense Battle Monument in Musaler (Musa Dagh) Village.
13. St. Virgin Mary Memorial Chapel in Nor (New) Edessa.
14. Memorial Fountain in Nor (New) Arabgir Neighborhood of Yerevan.
15. Memorial in Nor (New) Arabgir Neighborthood of Yerevan.
16. Memorial in Nor (New) Erzinka Village.

17. Self-Defense Battle Memorial in Nor (New) Hajen.
18. Memorial in Nor (New) Kharpert Village.
19. Memorial in Hin (Old) and Nor (New) Malatia Neighborhood of Yerevan.
20. Memorial in Nor (New) Sebastia Neighborhood of Yerevan.
21. Memorial in Nubarashen.
22. Commemorative Monument for the Fallen in Ohanavan Village.
23. Memorial in Shgharshik Village.
24. Memorial Complex in Stepanakert, Nagorno Karabagh.
25. Memorial in Takhmak Neighborhood of Yerevan.
26. Memorial in Tsithankov Village.
27. Memorial in Veti.
28. Memorial in Zovashen Village.

2. “Armenian Genocide” Memorials in Diaspora

i. Germany

There are three Armenian memorials in three different cities of that country:

1. Memorial in Braunschweig.
2. Memorial in Bremen.
3. Memorial in Stuttgart.

ii. The United States of America

Since the majority of Armenian population outside of Armenia lives in the United States of America, Armenian memorials in that country are quite high in number. The Armenians in that country put the genocide allegations on the center of their memories and bring this matter into question in every

phase of their lives. Especially to influence the Americans, they organized deliberate and persistent campaigns and for this purpose utilized arguments such as art works and sports competitions. They try to make all states of the country recognize Armenian allegations and especially in capital cities, projects to erect Armenian memorials were carried out. The number of Armenian memorials in America is 28 as from 2010 and these memorials are situated in below mentioned cities and states:

1. Living Tree With Plaque in Albuquerque, New Mexico.
2. Shrine to the Victims of the Armenian Genocide, Bayside, New York.
3. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Belmont, Massachusetts.
4. Boise Armenian Genocide Memorial Plaque, Boise.
5. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Cambridge, Massachusetts.
6. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Deaborn, Michigan.
7. Memorial Plaque in Denver, Colorado.
8. Statue of Gomidas Vartabed, Detroit, Michigan.
9. Memorial in Emerson, New Jersey.
10. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Glendale, California.
11. Memorial Monument in Glenview, Illinois.
12. Armenian Genocide Memorial at the Bergen County Courthouse.
13. Memorial in Jamaica Plain, Massachusetts.
14. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Milford.
15. Monument at Bicknell Park in Montebello, California.
16. Armenian Genocide Display in Ellis Island, New York.
17. Memorial in New York, New York.

To influence the Americans, they organized deliberate and persistent campaigns and for this purpose utilized arguments such as art works and sports competitions. They try to make all states of the country recognize Armenian allegations and especially in capital cities, projects to erect Armenian memorials were carried out.

18. Memorial in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.
19. Bayside Armenian Marker.
20. Armenian Martyrs’ Memorial Monument in Providence, Rhode Island.
21. The Armenian Heritage Park in Providence, Rhode Island.
22. Mt. Davidson Cross in San Francisco, California.
23. Monument in Santa Ana, California.
24. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Southfield, Michigan.
25. Armenian Genocide Museum of America, Washington D.C.
26. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) at St. Stephen’s Armenian Church in Watertown, Massachusetts.
27. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Watertown, Massachusetts.
28. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Worcester, Massachusetts.

iii. Argentine

In this country there are four memorials, three of which are situated in capital Buenos Aires and the last in Codova.

1. Memorial Fountain in Buenos Aires.
2. Memorial in Buenos Aires.
3. Monument in Buenos Aires.
4. Memorial in Codova.

iv. Australia

Two Armenian memorials in this country are located in the city of Sdney.

1. Memorial in Sydney.
2. The Armenian Martyrs of the 1915 Holocaust.

v. Austria

In this country, there are two Armenian memorials, both of which are in capital Vienne.

1. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Vienna.
2. Monument in Vienna, Austria.

vi. Belgium

The only Armenian memorial in this country is situated in Brussels.

Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Brussels.

vii. Brazil

There exist two Armenian memorials in Brazil.

1. Memorial in Rio De Janeiro.
2. Monument in Sao Paulo.

viii. Bulgaria

Two Armenian memorials were built in Bulgaria:

1. Memorial in Sofia.
2. Memorial in Plovdiv.

ix. Ethiopia

The only Armenian memorial in this country is located in Addis Ababa:

Armenian Genocide Memorial in Addis Ababa.

x. France

France is the richest (!) country in terms of Armenian memorials in the world. This number is so exaggerative that in France there exist more memorials

than in the Republic of Armenia which has 28 memorials and the United States of America. The memorials in France can be listed as:

1. Monument in Aix en Provence.
2. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Alfortville.
3. Memorial in Arnoville.
4. Memorial Plaque in Avignon.
5. Avenue of April Bouc Bel Air.
6. Armenia Place in Cannes.
7. Memorial Plaque in Gardanne.
8. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Charenton le Pont.
9. Memorial Stele in Charvieu.
10. Memorial Stele & Avenue of Armenian Genocide in Chasse sur Rhône.
11. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Clamart.
12. Monument & Avenue of 24 April Decines.
13. Avenue of Armenia & Memorial Stele in Draguignan.
14. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Grenoble.
15. Monument in Issy-les-Moulineaux.
16. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Lile.
17. Memorial Tree in Livry-Gargan.
18. Memorial in Lyon.
19. Memorial Lyonnais du genocide des Armeniens.
20. Avenue of April 24, Marseilles.
21. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Marseilles.

22. Monument in Marseilles.
23. Monument in Marseilles.
24. Monument & Avenue of April 24, Meyzieu.
25. Monument in Montpellier.
26. Komitas Monument and Armenian Genocide Memorial in Paris.
27. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Square of 24 Avril Saint Chamond.
28. Monument & Armenia Place in Saint Etienne.
29. Double Plaques in Place of 24 Avril Saint Martin-d'Hères.
30. Square of 24 Avril Septèmes les Vallons.
31. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) Sevrans.
32. Memorial Plaque in Toulon.
33. Monument in Valence.
34. Monument on Avenue 24 April Vienne.
35. Monument to Komitas in Villejuif.
36. Esplanade of 24 April Vitrolles.

xi. Georgia

In this country, there is only one Armenian memorial:

Armenian Genocide Memorial, Akhalkalak.

xii. India

In India, there exists one Armenian memorial:

Memorial in Calcutta.

xiii. Netherlands

In Netherlands, there is one Armenian memorial:

Memorial Khatchkar (Cross-Stone) in Assen.

xiv. England

In this country, there are two Armenian memorials, one in Cardiff and the other one in London:

1. The Armenian Genocide Monument, Cardiff.

2. Memorial in London.

In Iran, there exist seven Armenian memorials which are located inside Armenian churches or in the garden of churches. In other words, none of them is situated in public sphere.

xv. Iran

In Iran, there exist seven Armenian memorials which are located inside Armenian churches or in the garden of churches. In other words, none of them is situated in public sphere. Armenian memorials in Iran can be listed as:

1. Memorial in Abadan.
2. Memorial in Ahvaz.
3. Memorial in Arak.
4. Memorial in Isfahan.
5. Armenian Genocide Memorial in Tehran.
6. Memorial in Tehran.
7. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Urumieh.

xvi. Israel

The only Armenian memorial within the boundaries of Israel is in Jerusalem:

Memorial in Jerusalem.

xvii. Switzerland

The only Armenian memorial in Switzerland is located in Geneva.

Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Geneva.

xviii. Italy

In Italy, there are two Armenian memorials, one in Milan and the other one in Venice.

1. Memorial in Milan.
2. Memorial on Saint Lazarus Island, Venice.

xix. Canada

In Canada, Armenian memorials are situated in three cities: Cambridge, Montreal and Toronto.

1. Musa Dagh Memorial in Cambridge.
2. Monument in Montreal.
3. Monument in Toronto.

xx. Southern Cyprus

There are two Armenian memorials in Southern Cyprus:

1. The Armenian Genocide Memorial, Larnaca.
2. Monument in Nicosia.

xxi. Lebanon

In Lebanon, there are five Armenian memorials:

1. Musa Dagh Memorial in Anjar.
2. Memorial Chapel in Antelias.

3. Memorial Column in Beirut.
4. Monument in Bikfaya.
5. Memorial in Zmmar Village.

xxii. Egypt

In Egypt there are two Armenian memorials in Alexandria and Cairo:

1. Memorial in Alexandria.
2. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Cairo.

xxiii. Poland

The only Armenian memorial in Poland is in the city of Krakow.

Memorial Khatchkar (Stone-Cross) in Krakow.

xxiv. Syria

In Syria, there are six Armenian memorials in total, three of which are located in Aleppo. The others are respectively in Damascus, Der Zor and Margadeh

1. Memorial at Forty Martyrs Armenian Apostolic Church in Aleppo.
2. Monument at Armenian Evangelic Church of Betel in Aleppo.
3. Monument at St. Trinity Armenian Catholic Church in Aleppo, Syria.
4. Memorial at St. Sarkis Armenian Church in Damascus.
5. Monument and Memorial Complex at Der Zor.
6. Memorial at The Armenian Apostolic Church in Margadeh.

xxv. Chile

There are two Armenian memorials in Chile. These memorials, with the same name are in Santiago.

1. Memorial in Santiago.
2. Memorial in Santiago.

xxvi. Ukraine

In Ukraine, there exist three Armenian memorial, respectively in Kiev, Lvov and Odessa.

1. Memorial in Kiev.
2. Memorial in Lvov.
3. Memorial Khachkar (Cross-Stone) in Odessa.

xxvii. Uruguay

There are two Armenian memorials in Uruguay, both of which are in capital Montevideo:

1. Memorial at Armenian Church of Montevideo.
2. Memorial in Montevideo.

xxviii. Venezuela

The only Armenian memorial in Venezuela is located in capital Caracas:

Armenian Genocide Memorial in Caracas.

xxix. Greece

The Armenian memorials in Greece are situated in Athens and Thessaloniki:

1. Memorial and Bell in Athens.
2. Memorial in Thessaloniki.

CONCLUSION

Cultural assets in the form of monuments and inscriptions keep historical memory alive. These assets and the places where they are situated take an important place in the memories and agendas of people and nations due to the fact that they address the group psychology. Anywhere, those kinds of places are important in terms of attracting public’s attention. If these objects are predicated on the principal of abuse of human feelings, the situation becomes more complicated. One of the neglected aspects of Turkish-Armenian relations up to the present is the question of monuments and inscriptions. Those kinds of objects played an important role in the formation of some images such as “Cruel Turk” and “Oppressed Armenian”. Likewise, it is well known that commemorations, which take place in these historical memorials, become a show of force and appeal to Anti-Turkish feelings especially in April 24th both in Armenia and Diaspora. The only motive that is promoted in these ceremonies is “hostility and opposition to the Turks”. New generations are unconsciously impressed with motives of hostility and new Armenian generations that even do not know who the Turks are, are being transformed into an instrument of this hostility. The sole notion mentioned and

The only motive that is promoted in these ceremonies is “hostility and opposition to the Turks”. New generations are unconsciously impressed with motives of hostility and new Armenian generations that even do not know who the Turks are, are being transformed into an instrument of this hostility.

revived in these monuments is about “the Armenians who were oppressed, killed, massacred and destroyed in. For instance, on one of the monument inscription it is written that: “We Armenians dedicate this monument to the immortal memory of the 1.500.000 Armenian martyrs massacred by the Turkish government during the 1915 genocide”. Similarly, it is clearly expressed on many of these monuments that the aim of erecting the memorials was “to keep the memories of the Armenians who had been massacred by the Turks in 1915 alive”. Considering the fact that this approach and similar ones do not or will not have an effect upon Armenian generations and public opinion of various countries, these attempts could only be explained with “optimism” and “innocence”.

However, Turkey and Armenia are geographically close, two neighboring countries. This neighborliness will not change even the time and conditions change. In turn, it is obvious that making these two neighbouring countries’ people hostile to each other and raising generations with hostility is senseless. These policies which are followed unconsciously always lead to the

solutionlessness of the problem and these two neighboring countries are diverging from each other constantly. Both countries are negatively affected by this situation but it could be seen that the damage of Armenia is bigger than Turkey.

There are some peculiarities about the Armenian monuments. A considerable part of the countries where monuments are found, apart from Armenia, attract attention in terms of being countries accepting the genocide laws. However, every country that accepted these laws did not erect a monument such as Russia. At least, any recorded monument is beside the point. On the other hand, there are countries that exaggerate the act of erecting monuments. Although it makes sense in some extent that the number of this kind of monuments is Armenia, it is impossible to understand its rise to France. In other words, the record in the number of monuments is at France. This number is not directly proportionate to the total number of Armenians living in this country. As is known, countries such as the United States of America and Russian Federation are at the forefront in respect of population. However, France surpassed both of them. In addition, it is another issue of conflict that to what extent the existence of such kind of objects which are artificial and which recreates and reminds hostilities is humanistic and necessary.

In Armenia and also in some other countries, the erection of such kind of Armenian “genocide” memorials is a strategic aim like issuing decisions of genocide in parliaments. Through these monuments, it is being tried to win world’s public opinion subconsciousness and the approaching process to the target is being materialized. As decisions which recognize the so-called genocide are admitted in world’s parliaments, Armenian lobbies’ activities of putting the projects of statues and memorial symbols into practice are naturally affecting these countries’ public opinion. As could be observed in the content of this article, many different monuments carrying the same purpose were erected in different countries by Armenians. However, most of them was missed out or neglected by Turkey. Among these monuments most of which are statues, Turkey especially attribute importance to those situated in great countries. However, this interest could not go beyond of public statements in vain and unfulfilled strong reactions. It is known that Turkey’s tenderness to preserve its relations with European Union has an important role in this unresponsiveness.

The number of Armenian monuments in the world that are recorded and ascertained is total by 2010. If it is taken into consideration that this project of erecting monuments constitutes an intensity especially in 1965 which was the 50th anniversary of 1915 events, it is probable and expected that there will be a revival in this field in 2015, the 100th anniversary of the events.

Hence, according to a study related with this subject, there were only 16 monuments in the world in 1973 that coincided with the period after the 50th anniversary of 1915 events. 4 of them were situated in Armenia (then namely Soviet Armenia), Lebanon, the United States of America, and the rest in Syria, Egypt, Brazil, Bulgaria and Italy. These numbers show that Armenian propaganda and its effect was on the rise in certain anniversaries. Therefore, it seems more probable that there would be important developments in this field in the 100th anniversary of the “question”.

Although the highness of the number of monuments known as 154 as of 2010 seems at an alarming degree, it should not be forgotten that these are symbolic figures. Monuments and commemoration places are considered as meeting sites especially in April 24th. If it is viewed from a different standpoint, almost 90 percent of these so-called monuments consist of very small objects. Many of them are not in form of structures; instead they are made of stone or marble. There are many examples in the form of inscription put aside in an ordinary garden. There also exists in the form of memorial tree. Among these monuments the biggest and the most important one for the Armenians is the Monument, Museum and Research Complex at Dsidsernakaberd in Yerevan. No similar example of this complex could be found in Armenia or in other countries. This centre in Armenia is in the position of “kaaba” of “Turkish hostility” which is already kept alive. It is the main base of Armenian propaganda. Almost each visitor, who formally or informally visits the capital of the Armenian Republic, definitely is taken to this complex in order to get displayed Turkish “atrocities” over the Armenians through an emotional and visual show and people take a walk at the peaks of “Turkish hostility”. Armenians make this almost a religious and national ritual. In this way, the genocide conception becomes a part of daily life in Armenia. In Armenia or in other countries, although it is minor, the existence of these monuments and the exhibition of these objects in places visited every day led to some important admittance in time. This situation is immensely convenient with the aim of erecting monuments. Especially in Armenia and in other countries where Armenian population is dense, engraining this fact in even the children who are unable to pronounce correctly and teaching “Turcophobia” to Armenian children and youth with their mother tongue are very significant factors that abolish the expectations of solving the question of Turkish-Armenian relations in the near future. Therefore, in terms of dynamizing these sentiments and expectations and so on or of their attempts, these monuments have importance with regards to providing visual dimension of Armenian propaganda and Turkish hostility.

Yet, Turks and Armenians lived together for many centuries and interacted with each other. This period having lasted ten centuries, during which both

parties lived together merrily, is neglected as if it were not undergone and it is inexplicable that relations would end in “1915 deadlock”. Linger on this subject is dragging the problem into a deadlock. Moreover, that year the Ottoman State had serious and reasonable grounds to enforce “*sevk ve iskan kanunu*” known as *tehcir*. This law was not suddenly put into effect. The “Ottoman Armenians” mobilized against the state from the very beginning of the War and they cooperated with the Russians. This situation was even sufficient alone for issuing the decision of “*sevk ve iskan kanunu*”. However, these activities of the Armenians are perceived as if it never existed. They are acting as “the whole offence belongs to the Ottoman government and they did not play part in this matter”. Moreover, developments related with this subject are not limited with this: “traces of the activities of Ottoman Armenians”, especially between 1890-1915, also stuck in memories. In this respect, the cooperation of Armenians and “the enemy” coming from the East during the War is like the final straw. It was the main factor that triggered the decision.

It should be emphasized that to see Tehcir Law and practices of it as “genocide” or to state that the Armenians are behaved in a revengeful way is nothing but a waste of time. This law should be perceived as a requirement for Ottoman Empire to fight in the World War under favorable conditions. It has other examples in the world history. The Armenians have behaved with revenge feelings since that date and this situation is a reflection of Armenian nationalism which is Tashnak-based. However, how a nation devotes the bases of its nationalism to the destruction of another nation’s future, how it intends to influence next generation with such ideas. It is certainly impossible to figure out this mentality. Moreover, it can be easily observed that the Armenians have also suffered from this situation for a century. These misleading nationalist policies deepen the hostility between these neighboring countries. Therefore, these two neighboring countries are regarded as two different countries as if even they did not exist in the same world. By all means, neither Turkey nor Armenia can benefit from the persistence of this hostility. If only there existed thousands of “friendship memorials” were erected instead of “genocide memorials.”

KAYNAKÇA

Deliorman, Altan. *Türklere Karşı Ermeni Komitecileri*, Boğaziçi Yayınları, İstanbul, 1973.

Laçiner, Sedat. *Ermeni Sorunu, Diaspora ve Türk Dış Politikası*, Uluslararası Stratejik Araştırmalar Kurumu, Ankara, 2008.

Lütem, Ömer Engin. "Olaylar ve Yorumlar", *Ermeni Araştırmaları*, III/9 (Bahar 2003), s. 7-29.

Temelkuran, Ece. *Ağrı'nın Derinliği*, Everest Yayınları, İstanbul, 2009.

Tuğlacı, Pars. *Ermeni Edebiyatından Seçkiler*, İstanbul, 1992.

www.armenian-genocide.org, 16 Kasım – 27 Aralık 2010.

